



**MINUTES OF THE
GLENDALE CITY COUNCIL MEETING
Council Chambers
5850 West Glendale Avenue
May 8, 2012
7:00 p.m.**

The meeting was called to order by Mayor Elaine M. Scruggs, with Vice Mayor Steven E. Frate and the following Councilmembers present: Norma S. Alvarez, Joyce V. Clark, Yvonne J. Knaack, H. Philip Lieberman and Manuel D. Martinez.

Also present were Horatio Skeete, Assistant City Manager; Craig Tindall, City Attorney; and Pamela Hanna, City Clerk.

Mayor Scruggs called for the Pledge of Allegiance and a moment of silence was observed.

Mayor Scruggs recognized the boy scouts in attendance and thanked them for their attendance.

COMPLIANCE WITH ARTICLE VII, SECTION 6(c) OF THE GLENDALE CHARTER

A statement was filed by the City Clerk that the 4 resolutions to be considered at the meeting were available for public examination and the title posted at City Hall more than 72 hours in advance of the meeting.

APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE APRIL 24, 2012 CITY COUNCIL MEETING

It was moved by Clark, and seconded by Lieberman, to dispense with the reading of the minutes of the April 24, 2012 Regular City Council meeting, as each member of the Council had been provided copies in advance, and approve them as written. The motion carried unanimously.

PROCLAMATIONS AND AWARDS

PROCLAIM MAY 12, 2012 AS SALVATION ARMY DAY

This is a request for City Council to proclaim May 12, 2012 as Salvation Army Day in the City of Glendale. Major Adam Morales, Glendale Corps Commanding Officer, from the Salvation Army will be present to accept the proclamation.

The Salvation Army in Glendale is located at 6010 West Northern Avenue. It has been serving families in need in the Glendale area for 40 years by providing emergency food boxes, utility assistance, seasonal assistance, emergency transportation, hydration stations, computer instruction classes, emergency lodging, youth character building programs, women and men social programs, financial and family assistance advisement and social and spiritual development programs.

In 2011, the Salvation Army in Glendale assisted 886 persons with utilities, distributed clothing to 875 persons, provided baby items to 1,098 persons, prepared 1,251 hot meals for needy children, and distributed emergency food boxes for 24,229 persons.

The Salvation Army in Glendale will be celebrating their 40 year anniversary on May 12, 2012.

The recommendation is to proclaim May 12, 2012 as Salvation Army Day in the City of Glendale, and present the proclamation to Major Adam Morales from the Salvation Army.

Mayor Scruggs called Major Adam Morales, Glendale Corps Commanding Officer, forward and presented the proclamation.

Mayor Scruggs asked who doesn't recognize the Salvation Army. She continued that she thinks that all of us have been familiar with the Salvation Army ever since we were kids. Probably the first time we, as children, came into awareness would be with the red buckets at Christmas and collecting money to be able to buy things for families in need. But, the Salvation Army does so much in the community in which they are, so much behind the scene that people don't even realize is going on. Mayor Scruggs stated that sometimes in her office, she get calls where people have pretty much exhausted all of their options and still need money or shelter or food, need to pay their utility bills, they are just in dire need. Her office always calls the Salvation Army and almost always they are able to help. They do so many things in so many ways. She continued that she had written in one of her weekly email bulletins, she wasn't sure if she sent a copy to Major Morales, about the Salvation Army's assistance to the homeless. She stated that they do so many things, so it is really an honor and a privilege this evening to present this proclamation to Major Morales.

Major Adam Morales, Glendale Corps Commanding Officer, thanked the Mayor and Council. He thanked City administration for their support over 40 years in the City of Glendale and many more years of continued collaborative partnerships in serving the community.

PROCLAIM MAY 20 THROUGH MAY 26, 2012 AS NATIONAL PUBLIC WORKS WEEK

This is a request for City Council to proclaim May 20 through May 26, 2012 as National Public Works Week in the City of Glendale.

Representatives of the Public Works, Transportation, and Water Services groups will be present to receive the proclamation on behalf of all Glendale employees who provide and maintain the infrastructure and services collectively known as public works.

Instituted as a public education campaign by the American Public Works Association in 1960, National Public Works Week calls attention to the importance of public works in community life. Some notable highlights include a U.S. Senate resolution affirming the first National Public Works Week in 1960, letters of acknowledgment from Presidents Dwight Eisenhower and Lyndon Johnson, and a Presidential Proclamation signed by John F. Kennedy in 1962.

The American Public Works Association is designating May 20 through May 26, 2012 as National Public Works Week. The theme for this year's celebration is "Public Works: Creating a Lasting Impression" and it speaks to the never-ending effort of public works professionals to use sustainable solutions to bring their communities the highest possible quality of life within a framework of environmental, social, and economic responsibility.

Public Works includes programs and services such as land development and flood control, environmental and facilities engineering, street design and maintenance, equipment and facility maintenance, transportation and city roadway systems, right-of-way beautification and graffiti removal, solid waste collection and disposal, as well as water and waste water services. In addition, Public Works personnel are among the first responders during emergencies and natural disasters, often going above and beyond the call of duty to quickly maintain and restore needed city services. This proclamation seeks to raise the public's awareness of the contributions which public works employees make in the community, and to honor the professional men and women who serve the public every day with quiet dedication.

The recommendation is to proclaim May 20 through May 26, 2012 as National Public Works Week in the City of Glendale, and present the proclamation to city staff representing the Public Works, Transportation, and Water Services groups.

Mayor Scruggs called Debbie Albert, Principal Engineer from Transportation Services, Stephen Lopez, Utilities System Technician Water Services, and Ken Vayda, Streets Supervisor Public Works. She continued that they could take most of the meeting to talk about what Public Works does in our lives and in our City, and she thinks everyone would all be surprised how many areas of service these folks are really in, things that you don't even think about and things that everyone takes for granted.

Mayor Scruggs said when you think of disasters in our community or you think of major issues that require immediate responses, you always think of police and fire as the first responders and definitely, they are. Right there with them, alongside of them, and long after they leave the scene, are public works employees from various departments making sure that our water systems, our sewer systems, everything that is relied upon for our daily lives, are clean, protected and free of whatever hazardous materials may have entered the area or if any breaks or leaks, or whatever. Mayor Scruggs stated that her hat was off to all of you truly.

Debbie Albert accepted the proclamation on behalf of Public Works employees. She stated that these are the functions of the City that touches people's lives. From having clean water, to being able to having trash and recyclables picked up at the curbside, getting from home to your place of work on a well-maintained roadway is all part of the job. This proclamation helps raise awareness of the contributions made by Public Works employees throughout the community.

CONSENT AGENDA

Items on the consent agenda are of a routine nature or have been previously studied by the City Council at a work session. They are intended to be acted upon in one motion.

Mr. Horatio Skeete, Assistant City Manager, read agenda item numbers 1 through 6 and Ms. Pamela Hanna, City Clerk, read consent agenda resolution item numbers 7 through 9 by number and title.

Councilmember Lieberman requested item number 5 be heard separately.

Mayor Scruggs requested item number 9 be heard separately.

1. SPECIAL EVENT LIQUOR LICENSE, ARIZONA EXTREME BASEBALL CLUB

This is a request for City Council to approve a special event liquor license for the Arizona Extreme Baseball Club. The event will be held at University of Phoenix Stadium's Southwest Parking Lot located at 1 Cardinals Drive on June 8, 9, 10, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, and 19, 2012. The purpose of this special event liquor license is for fundraisers at Cirque Du Soleil.

If this application is approved, the total number of days expended by this applicant will be 10 of the allowed 10 days per calendar year. Under the provisions of A.R.S. § 4-203.02, the Arizona Department of Liquor Licenses and Control may issue a special event liquor license only if the Council recommends approval of such license.

The City of Glendale Planning, Police, and Fire Departments have reviewed the application and determined that it meets all technical requirements.

Based on the information provided under the background, it is staff's recommendation to forward this application to the Arizona Department of Liquor Licenses and Control with a recommendation of approval.

2. SPECIAL EVENT LIQUOR LICENSE, 56 MOS BOOSTER CLUB

This is a request for City Council to approve a special event liquor license for the 56 MOS Booster Club. The event will be held at University of Phoenix Stadium's Southwest Parking Lot located at 1 Cardinals Drive on June 20, 21, 22, 23, 24, 26, 27, 28, 29, and 30, 2012. The purpose of this special event liquor license is for fundraisers at Cirque Du Soleil.

If this application is approved, the total number of days expended by this applicant will be 10 of the allowed 10 days per calendar year. Under the provisions of A.R.S. § 4-203.02, the Arizona Department of Liquor Licenses and Control may issue a special event liquor license only if the Council recommends approval of such license.

The City of Glendale Planning, Police, and Fire Departments have reviewed the application and determined that it meets all technical requirements.

Based on the information provided under the background, it is staff's recommendation to forward this application to the Arizona Department of Liquor Licenses and Control with a recommendation of approval.

3. SPECIAL EVENT LIQUOR LICENSE, DEEP WITHIN REHAB CENTER

This is a request for City Council to approve a special event liquor license for the Deep Within Rehab Center. The event will be held at University of Phoenix Stadium's Southwest Parking Lot located at 1 Cardinals Drive on July 1, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 11, 12, and 13, 2012. The purpose of this special event liquor license is for fundraisers at Cirque Du Soleil.

If this application is approved, the total number of days expended by this applicant will be 10 of the allowed 10 days per calendar year. Under the provisions of A.R.S. § 4-203.02, the Arizona Department of Liquor Licenses and Control may issue a special event liquor license only if the Council recommends approval of such license.

The City of Glendale Planning, Police, and Fire Departments have reviewed the application and determined that it meets all technical requirements.

Based on the information provided under the background, it is staff's recommendation to forward this application to the Arizona Department of Liquor Licenses and Control with a recommendation of approval.

4. SPECIAL EVENT LIQUOR LICENSE, CHOIR BOYS SOCIAL CLUB

This is a request for City Council to approve a special event liquor license for the Choir Boys Social Club. The event will be held at University of Phoenix Stadium's Southwest Parking Lot located at 1 Cardinals Drive on Saturday, July 14, from 4 p.m. to 10 p.m. and Sunday, July 15, 2012, from 1 p.m. to 7 p.m. The purpose of this special event liquor license is for fundraisers at Cirque Du Soleil.

If this application is approved, the total number of days expended by this applicant will be six of the allowed 10 days per calendar year. Under the provisions of A.R.S. § 4-203.02, the Arizona Department of Liquor Licenses and Control may issue a special event liquor license only if the Council recommends approval of such license.

The City of Glendale Planning, Police, and Fire Departments have reviewed the application and determined that it meets all technical requirements.

Based on the information provided under the background, it is staff's recommendation to forward this application to the Arizona Department of Liquor Licenses and Control with a recommendation of approval.

5. LIQUOR LICENSE NO. 5-5658, WINCO FOODS #115

This item was heard after the consent agenda items.

6. LIQUOR LICENSE NO. 5-5793, CHEERS TAVERN

This is a request for City Council to approve a person-to-person, location-to-location transferable series 6 (Bar - All Liquor) license for Cheers Tavern located at 5915 West Bell Road. The Arizona Department of Liquor Licenses and Control application (No. 06070431) was submitted by Leesa Lynn Montague.

The location of the establishment is 5915 West Bell Road in the Sahuaro District. The property is zoned C-2 (General Commercial). The population density within a one-mile radius is 13,419. This series 6 is a new license, therefore, the approval of this license will increase the number of liquor licenses in the area by one. The current number of liquor licenses within a one-mile radius is as listed below.

Series	Type	Quantity
06	Bar - All Liquor	7
07	Bar - Beer and Wine	3
09	Liquor Store - All Liquor	5
10	Liquor Store - Beer and Wine	5
12	Restaurant	21
	Total	41

The City of Glendale Planning, Police, and Fire Departments have reviewed the application and determined that it meets all technical requirements.

No public protests were received during the 20-day posting period.

Based on information provided under the background, it is staff's recommendation to forward this application to the Arizona Department of Liquor Licenses and Control with a recommendation of approval.

CONSENT RESOLUTIONS

7. 2012 JUSTICE ASSISTANCE GRANT AWARD

This is a request for City Council to adopt a resolution authorizing the City Manager to enter into a Memorandum of Understanding for acceptance of grant funding from the 2012 Edward Byrne Memorial Justice Assistance Grant Program in the approximate amount of \$94,222.

The U.S. Department of Justice has made funding available to cities through the Edward Byrne Memorial Justice Assistance Grant Program. Maricopa County serves as the fiscal agent for this pass-through grant.

The grant funding will be used toward a portion of the cost of replacing the current Computer Aided Dispatch (CAD) and Records Management System (RMS) with a more advanced system. The replacement CAD and RMS software includes modules for booking, records management, dispatch, field reporting, property and evidence management and crime analysis. The estimated completion date for the replacement of the CAD and RMS is September 1, 2013.

On October 25, 2011, Council authorized the expenditure of up to \$5,600,000 for the purchase and implementation of a new CAD and RMS system for the Police Department.

On August 23, 2011, Council approved the acceptance of \$122,631 from the 2011 Edward Byrne Memorial Justice Grant.

This is one-time funding by the U.S. Department of Justice. There is no financial match required for this grant. This funding will be used to lower the amount that was previously allocated for this project.

Grants	Capital Expense	One-Time Cost	Budgeted	Unbudgeted	Total
X					\$94,222

Account Name, Fund, Account and Line Item Number:

A specific account will be established in Fund 1840, the city's grant fund, once the agreement is fully executed.

The recommendation is to waive reading beyond the title and adopt a resolution authorizing the City Manager to enter into a Memorandum of Understanding for acceptance of grant funding from the 2012 Edward Byrne Memorial Justice Assistance Grant Program in the approximate amount of \$94,222.

Resolution No. 4569 New Series was read by number and title only, it being A RESOLUTION OF THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF GLENDALE, MARICOPA COUNTY, ARIZONA, AUTHORIZING THE ACCEPTANCE OF GRANT FUNDING FROM THE 2012 EDWARD BYRNE MEMORIAL JUSTICE ASSISTANCE GRANT PROGRAM IN THE APPROXIMATE AMOUNT OF \$94,222 FOR THE GLENDALE POLICE DEPARTMENT.

8. INTERGOVERNMENTAL AGREEMENTS WITH VALLEY LAW ENFORCEMENT AGENCIES

This is a request for City Council to adopt a resolution authorizing the City Manager to enter into intergovernmental agreements (IGAs) with sixteen law enforcement agencies.

In May of 2006, the City Manager entered into a contract with Global Spectrum, the managing agency for the University of Phoenix Stadium (Stadium) for public safety services. The Glendale Police Department approached numerous valley and state law enforcement agencies

who agreed to assist with public safety services at the Stadium. Those IGAs were brought before Council during subsequent meetings and are now due for renewal.

The IGAs allow the agencies to join the valley-wide coalition, which assists the Glendale Police Department with public safety services and security for events at the Stadium. The agencies participating are: Avondale, Buckeye, Chandler, El Mirage, Goodyear, Mesa, Peoria, Phoenix, Scottsdale, Surprise, Tempe, Tolleson, Wickenburg, Arizona State University Police, Arizona Department of Public Safety and Maricopa County Sheriff's Office. The IGAs have three-year terms. Global Spectrum reimburses the city for public safety and security services provided by these agencies and covers the cost of workers compensation.

On March 10, 2009, Council authorized the City Manager to enter into IGAs with several agencies to join the valley-wide coalition.

Through these partnerships, the Glendale Police Department and all participating law enforcement agencies will be working together to ensure that citizens and visitors to Glendale experience a safe environment while attending stadium events.

The recommendation is to waive reading beyond the title and adopt a resolution authorizing the City Manager to enter into intergovernmental agreements with sixteen law enforcement agencies.

Resolution No. 4570 New Series was read by number and title only, it being A RESOLUTION OF THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF GLENDALE, MARICOPA COUNTY, ARIZONA, AUTHORIZING AND DIRECTING THE ENTERING INTO OF SIXTEEN INTERGOVERNMENTAL AGREEMENTS WITH LAW ENFORCEMENT AGENCIES FOR A VALLEY-WIDE COALITION FOR PUBLIC SAFETY SERVICES AND SECURITY FOR EVENTS AT THE UNIVERSITY OF PHOENIX STADIUM ON BEHALF OF THE GLENDALE POLICE DEPARTMENT.

9. INTERGOVERNMENTAL AGREEMENTS WITH SALT RIVER PROJECT FOR THE DESIGN OF ELECTRICAL FACILITIES FOR STREET LIGHTING

This item was heard after the consent agenda items.

It was moved by Frate and seconded by Martinez, to approve the recommended actions on Consent Agenda Item Nos. 1 through 4 and 6 through 8, including the approval and adoption of Resolution No. 4569 New Series, and Resolution No. 4570 New Series; and to forward Special Event Liquor License Applications for Arizona Extreme Baseball Club, 56 MOS Booster Club, Deep Within Rehab Center and Choir Boys Social Club for charity fundraisers and Liquor License Application No. 5-5793 for Cheers Tavern to the State of Arizona Department of Liquor Licenses and Control, with the recommendation for approval. The motion carried unanimously.

5. LIQUOR LICENSE NO. 5-5658, WINCO FOODS #115

This item was removed from the consent agenda and heard separately.

Susan Matousek, Revenue Administrator, presented this item.

This is a request for City Council to approve a person-to-person, location-to-location transferable series 9 (Liquor Store - All Liquor) license for WinCo Foods #115 located at 5023 West Peoria Avenue. The Arizona Department of Liquor Licenses and Control application (No. 09078000) was submitted by Nicholas Carl Guttilla.

The location of the establishment is 5023 West Peoria Avenue in the Cactus District. The property is zoned C-2 (General Commercial). The population density within a one-mile radius is 22,619. This series 9 is a new license, therefore, the approval of this license will increase the number of liquor licenses in the area by one. The current number of liquor licenses within a one-mile radius is as listed below.

Series	Type	Quantity
06	Bar - All Liquor	5
07	Bar - Beer and Wine	2
09	Liquor Store - All Liquor	5
10	Liquor Store - Beer and Wine	6
12	Restaurant	4
	Total	22

The City of Glendale Planning, Police, and Fire Departments have reviewed the application and determined that it meets all technical requirements.

On April 24, 2012, it was recommended by Council to forward this application to the Arizona Department of Liquor Licenses and Control with a recommendation of approval. Since that time, staff has ascertained that there were eleven additional protests received electronically during the 20-day posting period that were not forwarded to Council. Therefore, this application is being brought forward again with all protest information included for Council review and consideration.

One written and eleven electronic protests were received during the 20-day posting period and will be forwarded to the Arizona Department of Liquor Licenses and Control.

Based on information provided under the background, it is staff's recommendation to forward this application to the Arizona Department of Liquor Licenses and Control with a recommendation of approval.

Councilmember Joyce Clark asked whether the standard of a consistent number of licenses in an area is how a determination was made. She disagrees with that. Each license should be considered on its own merits.

Ms. Matousek stated it was one of the criteria reviewed.

Councilmember Lieberman stated that there are 18 protests, and not one letter approving the application. Ms. Matousek stated that there were duplicate submittals in the protest period that had a slightly different comment, so both were submitted and counted as one. Three protests were outside the protest period and were submitted, as staff thought the communications should be shared with the Mayor and Council. Councilmember Lieberman thanked the people from WinCo Foods for taking time meeting with him.

Nicholas Guttilla, legal representative for WinCo Foods #115, spoke. He is the agent and attorney for the applicant WinCo Foods. He stated that as an attorney he expressed his objection to two things; first, the statute that governs the liquor licenses sets a 60 day limit within which the local government can act. The City has already acted within the 60 days; he submits there is nothing in Title 4 that authorizes the local government to reconsider after the 60 day period. He continued that generally, if there is no recommendation after the 60 day timeframe, it is submitted as no recommendation; if something comes in late, it is still submitted as no recommendation. In this case, there was a recommendation for approval, based upon what Council had in front of them. Mr. Guttilla stated that number two, because the hearing is regulated by the Liquor Code Title 4, that statute should be followed. Staff rejected protests that are outside the one mile limit or protests outside the 20 day period because that is what the statute says. However, staff has not rejected protests not filed with the clerk. Statutes say the protests must be filed with the city clerk. These protests were filed with the wrong entity; the licensing and tax division. Since these are regulated by Title 4, the hearing should comply with Title 4. Mr. Guttilla stated that he had written to, and discussed this with, the city attorney, and Mr. Guttilla objects to it. He is participating under protest.

Mr. Guttilla then spoke as agent for the applicant. At the last meeting, he indicated the store was 93,000 feet. He found out subsequently that because of zoning and local constituent concern, a rezoning has not taken place; the store is going to be 71,000 feet, which is less than the normal for the valley. The two stores in operation for the last 30 days, because of grand opening events, have higher customer count but they expect an average of 25,000 people per week. Mr. Guttilla commented that the City has 15-20 protests from the service area of a community which is much bigger, as they serve a significant portion of the community. The trade area is 5 miles, so customers are drawn from all over the place. When the zoning was considered, the WinCo Foods presentation covered the tax benefit of \$1.5 million per year. This store cannot compete and won't go in without a liquor license. Mr. Guttilla continued that it would be difficult to have a large grocery store in the valley without a liquor license stating that people won't go, it won't be built and it won't survive. WinCo Foods is brand new in the valley, so it will be hard to get support for the store. There are 85 stores throughout the country. This is an employee owned and operated store. There will be 200 employees at that location. Liquor isn't the biggest selling product, it's between 1.5-2% of the sales, but the store has to have it or people won't come in. A grocery store is an appropriate place to sell liquor. At WinCo Foods, if a clerk sells to an inappropriate person, they are fired. Mr. Guttilla continued that in closing, Council shouldn't be reviewing this application again, he is objecting as a lawyer. The 22 licenses within a square mile are irrelevant, since you are comparing restaurants, bars, convenience markets and beer and wine stores. There are 5 licenses that are series 9 within the square mile.

Mayor Scruggs called for questions. She asked if there were any WinCo Foods store representatives present. She wanted to ask a question from someone very familiar with the stores. Rudy Morfin, Southwest Division Vice President of WinCo Foods Southwest Division which includes the Arizona Market, came forward. He noted that he lives in Murrieta, California, and has worked for WinCo Foods for 16 years.

Mayor Scruggs said prior to the last meeting she hadn't gone to a WinCo Foods market yet, but she was so intrigued by what was said at that meeting about WinCo Foods market and the comments of bad things happening, so she girded herself and went to WinCo Foods. She checked out, and as she was walking down a main concourse; she noticed a U shaped area; another room and in there was all the liquor. Beer and Wine is throughout the store, but to purchase liquor, you go into the separate area, with a separate cash register, and a separate cashier. From 9:00 p.m. to 9:00 a.m. they pull and lock a gate to that area. If someone comes in the store and wants to buy a bottle of liquor, a main cashier has to go in to this separate area to get it. Mayor Scruggs asked if this was how all the stores were modeled.

Mr. Morfin replied that this is the model for all the stores. It did hurt the business somewhat, but dealing with employee safety and theft issues made the change worth it. They are primarily there to sell groceries.

Mayor Scruggs had never seen a grocery store do that. It has to have hurt their business to a degree, but loss control and theft prevention are issues to address. The whole concept of people making a midnight run for vodka doesn't exist. Even in the smaller store which WinCo Foods is required to build, because of the neighbor concerns, liquor will be handled the same way? Mr. Morfin replied yes. Mayor Scruggs stated that she met many fine Glendale citizens in the store who stopped and chatted.

Mickey Hughes, a Barrel resident, said she wanted to speak strongly against granting WinCo Foods a liquor licenses. There are smaller grocery stores in the area, and she knows the people working there and they are afraid they will be out of work. There are several stores in the area with liquor licenses, which she described. There are also drive through liquor stores, a bar, convenience stores, and a pharmacy, all selling liquor. There are 9 stores selling liquor in this area. WinCo Foods does not belong in a neighborhood. It is a warehouse type of store. It would be located at the end of her street, and she wouldn't like it there; a few feet from her front window. Also, the only way in and out of KinderCare is 51st Avenue and this 24/7 megastore would be across the street. Another bother is that at a 24/7 store, there will be lights in someone's window, backyard, or bedroom, because they are so close. The sounds from the delivery trucks are another issue. She has been there since 1977 as an original home owner. It is already hard to get onto 51st Avenue; once this is built she will have to drive through residential streets to go north or east. She feels the extra pressure and detriment to the neighborhood is not worth the money that would dropped initially. When this comes in you will lose other things. If one of the other stores closes, it will be an empty box. Ms. Hughes stated that there is an overabundance of retail stores; there are 100 vacant stores in their neighborhood. They don't need another grocery store.

Mary Savchick, a Cactus resident, said she represents CABBI-Citizens Against Big Box Invasion. At the April 24th meeting, a council person said they hadn't heard what happened in other places and what could happen here. She reported at the last hearing what her research had shown and what would happen if the liquor license had been approved. Over the past two years they have been telling council how they don't want a big box store in the middle of these well-established neighborhoods. They have provided information of devastation to other areas from big box stores. She provided a book, Big Box Swindle; they sent emails and pictures of people's home with 'No WinCo' in their yards and windows. She presented council with a CD of photos of over 100 vacant storefronts in this neighborhood. She also provided a packet to further inform the council. How many ways can they say no? She also sent cards from the district with over 200 protests.

Ms. Savchick continued that they know that once again council will vote to approve the license for WinCo Foods. Council speaks of protecting the integrity of neighborhoods, but they will approve this request. She submitted a list of 32 lawsuits WinCo Foods has received stating that Arizona would be next. The citizens put council on the dais, and it is incredible that Council would vote against their constituent's wishes in favor of an out of state business. They lost faith and no longer trust the city government. She asked Council to redeem themselves and do the job they were elected to do; represent and speak for constituents.

Kathy Fletcher, a Cactus resident, was not present. She is running late so her written protest was submitted by Mary Savchik.

Dennis Gerhard, a Barrel resident, spoke. He opposes giving WinCo Foods a liquor license. If WinCo Foods does not get a liquor license, they will go away. Two years ago, residents said no to WinCo Foods. Two years later nothing has changed. They say no to a liquor license to WinCo Foods. Mr. Gerhard stated that WinCo Foods will ruin the peace and tranquility of the neighborhood. They will create more traffic and noise, and increase crime in their neighborhood. The residents have lived there 20 years or more, and WinCo Foods has been part of Glendale for 30 days. They look to council to save the citizens and to say no to WinCo Food's liquor license.

Andrew Marwick, Deerfield, Illinois, and Phoenix, Arizona, spoke. To put this in perspective, on May 24th he will be speaking at the Deerfield Planning Commission regarding four tennis courts to be placed at the Briarwood Country Club. Four tennis courts do not compare to the 71,000 square foot supermarket. The impact on surrounding businesses will be devastating comparing the Deerfield grocery stores, which are more successful and not marginally hanging on. There are downsides to this. The tennis courts would generate 1-200 people in a day. The store will have 24,000 per day which is a lot of traffic. The City should carefully consider the traffic issue, and how much trash will be generated in the neighborhood. It will have a major impact. It was stated that there are other grocery stores in the area, and WinCo Foods could put them out of business. The stores are not doing that much business, and very easily, some would be driven out. The upside of \$1.5 million and 200 employees has to be carefully balanced to the downside. It is a big impact to the neighbors. He cannot comprehend what his neighbors would say if someone wanted to put in a supermarket in his neighborhood. He is not for or against it. The city should carefully consider this; this is very important issue to the city.

Marlene Rosen, a Cactus resident, said she wants to say she opposes the issuance of the liquor license and the grocery store being built there, because of the amount of grocery stores in the area. The Council had talked about the tax revenue coming because of the grocery store. They feel they will be taking business from current stores and putting into the new store. She wanted to express her opposition.

Robert Rosen, a Cactus resident, said he has lived there 40 years. Some of the statistics are mind boggling; 22 places to buy liquor within a mile. Who is going to drink all that liquor? They are about 1 block from WinCo Foods, and he finds broken bottles in front of his house, and he had his car put on blocks and a tire and wheel was missing. The others lug nuts were loosened, and he almost lost another tire while driving. He asked why add to the burden and threat to their neighborhood and his house. He continued that 25,000 people a week is about 20,000 cars invading the neighborhood with squealing tires exhaust fumes, and all the other things from an abundance of cars. He heard about the cheap alcohol and low prices and expects that is going to add to the amount of people impacting their neighborhood. He is not opposed to liquor sales, but doesn't want to be buried in it. He strongly objects to giving a license to these folks. He hopes they will be able to shoot it down.

Kathy Fletcher, Cactus District said she lives behind and south of the proposed site. Both she and her husband are opposed to this liquor license being issued. Many others already listed the same reasons.

John Loving, Shannon Coyne, Audrey Maxwell, Chuck Jared, Arlene Lipton and Kenneth Lipton, Cactus residents, submitted cards in opposition but elected not to speak.

Mayor Scruggs called for questions or discussion from councilmembers.

Councilmember Martinez had a question of staff. It has been stated by several individuals that the store would bring a lot of traffic to the neighborhood. What is the traffic in the neighborhood around the corner of 59th and Northern, as a comparison? It also has residential area all around it and he would like to compare the neighborhoods.

Jamsheed Mehta, Transportation Services Executive Director, stated that he does not have the specifics on the traffic counts at this location at this time. A traffic impact study was prepared for WinCo Foods, and he would have to get back to them with specific information on that area and how it compares to other locations.

Vice Mayor Frate asked if this location had arterial streets on both 51st and Peoria. What is the traffic count for an arterial street?

Mr. Mehta stated that it varies by the hour of the day but expected anything from 25-35,000 cars and possibly even higher on a 5 or 6 lane road. He doesn't know the volumes of the last count for this area. When WinCo Foods was proposed to be a larger facility there was a traffic study prepared, and then when they downscaled another study was completed.

Vice Mayor Frate stated that the traffic is already there going down the street, it will basically be turning right or left from the street. He has a WinCo Foods store in his district. If someone is coming home from work they won't drive through the neighborhood to get to the store, when they are already on the main road to begin with. The streets already have the capacity and already have the vehicle traffic. The people already on the streets will be the ones to go in; there won't be an increase of 50,000 cars going down the avenue because of WinCo Foods.

Mr. Mehta stated that the study addressed many of the neighborhood's concerns, not just adjacent to the site, but those north and west to the site. If there are intrusions of traffic that they think would happen, they would have suggested the spacing and location driveways would be situated to serve this new development.

Councilmember Lieberman stated that this is one of the nine intersections in his district that are going to, or were, rebuilt two or three years ago. The entire corner on all four sides has been rebuilt and can accommodate more traffic. His other comment is related to a basic need or want that he hasn't received from all the people who spoke, saying they need or want a liquor store in that location. Person after person says they don't want it. He was hoping for an even blend of comments, but there wasn't.

Vice Mayor Frate, because he has a WinCo Foods store in his district, he would like to give more information. The zoning says they can build a store, and there is nothing council can do about that. The liquor in the store is a convenience at the WinCo Foods in his district. He too has walked into the liquor store room, which is only about a third of the size, other stores. There are several other big box stores around and across the street. He has not had any complaints. In fact, the other stores remodeled and the consumer has benefited from new lower prices. It is true that a lot of people would be hired for the store, and a lot live in Glendale. Some of the neighbors said their houses are across the street. In his district, you can stand in the driveway in the east side, and you can literally throw a rock to a house on Hartford Street. He has not had one protest with problems with WinCo Foods. They were told that delivery trucks have to enter and leave by 59th Avenue. Up to this time they have been a good neighbor. If you haven't been there, go yourself and see it, ask people what they think of it. Not everyone just shops at one grocery store; they go to a variety of stores. This is what pushes competition, and this is why Arizona has such a small margin of profit on the grocery business; it's 1% or less, so they go on volume. They do a lot of volume at Fry's grocery stores. WinCo Foods doesn't have a pharmacy; there is a difference between the stores. There is also a Tutor Time located near the WinCo at approximately 57th Avenue and Bell Road, and there has been no issue. WinCo Foods spends millions, and have a big investment in the area.

Councilmember Martinez had a question for representatives from WinCo. Several individuals were concerned about the 24/7 store and deliveries. He asked about the schedules for deliveries. Are they standard, done in the daylight hours or all hours of the day and night?

Rudy Morfin, WinCo Foods, Vice President, responded that deliveries are in the morning, and the freight usually comes in between 8 and 10, and could be as late as 11. Unless something happens to the truck, they try to be there before the freight crew arrives, which normally starts at 10:00.

Mayor Scruggs explained the history of this project to those present; this has been going on for over two years. She showed a map with green and yellow shaded areas. The dark green spot represents C-2 zoning which has been on this property since 1973. What the zoning allows by rights, without any other permission, are restaurants, retail stores including general merchandising, food, apparel, home and office furnishings, hardware, professional, administrative and business offices, personal services such as barbershops and beauty salons, small appliance repair, laundry and dry cleaning, mortuaries, automotive services, commercial parking lots, indoor recreational facilities, veterinary clinics, appliance, furniture and household equipment rentals, child care center, medical or dental clinics, churches, business schools, financial institutions, bar or cocktail lounges. The other spot on the map represents the C-3 zoning which isn't in the city anymore. It was approved on that spot in 1973, to allow the La Corona foods manufacturing. This allows wholesale trade and storage of durable and non-durable goods, building supplies, hardware sales and service, auto repair services, cocktail lounges with live entertainment, religious missions and shelters, workshops, small appliance service and repair, equipment and machinery sales or rental other than industrial, self-storage warehouses, automobile and recreation vehicle leasing and rentals, new and used cars, trucks and recreational vehicles sales, business and trade schools, hotels and motels, mobile home sales, heavy equipment sales and service, nightclub/dance halls, laundry, dry cleaning establishments, towing, and recreation vehicle storage facilities.

Mayor Scruggs wanted to give a picture of what can come in; and if the property owner wants to sell or rent the property to any of these businesses, they can do this and they have been able to do this for 40 years. To do this grocery store, another license, the liquor license is required. Council is only the recommenders for this request. WinCo Foods wanted to move the store away from homes with buffers and driveways and the neighborhoods said no. WinCo Foods took the next action and determined to build where they have the right to build. They were willing to do a lot of things, and the neighborhood didn't want the WinCo Foods store, but they have the right to build it there.

Mayor Scruggs continued that two weeks ago council voted yes; 5 to 1. Then it was found that there were a lot of protestors that weren't listed, so they determined to do it again. Now Council has a new conundrum since the rehearing may not even be legal. The Arizona Department of Liquor Licenses has to consider different reasons for approval, and neighbors' not wanting the store is not a matter to be considered. If you are asking why they are building the store there, it is because it is legal, they have the right to. All the residents have every right to go to the hearing and speak as to why they don't want to have the store there. When she was at the store, it was exceptionally well managed, and someone was following her around outside to get her cart. She may not go back because she doesn't have the desire to put it on the conveyor belt, ring it up and bag it. However, they have a very controlled liquor department.

Councilmember Clark said WinCo Foods does have the right to build there. She personally has nothing against WinCo Foods and would love one in her district, as they have no grocery stores in her district. What she is getting from this hearing is that this neighborhood just doesn't want a big box retailer in their neighborhood and they are doing everything to kill it off. If this were more of a genuine liquor license protest, she may support it, as she has supported a lot of

neighborhoods, but in this case that is not what she is seeing. She is seeing another attempt to kill off a retailer that has a right to build on that site. There are a lot of far worse options in those permitted zoning that could come in to that location. She is regretful that when the residents had the opportunity to work with WinCo Foods and get the buffering to the neighborhoods, they didn't. It would have helped a lot. If WinCo Foods is a good neighbor, they may put those buffers in anyway. She feels liquor in supermarkets is appropriate, and she would rather see it at a supermarket than some of the little stores we have around town. It does meet the need of a local shopper who decides to pick up a bottle of wine or alcohol. She will again support the WinCo Foods liquor license application.

Mayor Scruggs called for a motion.

It was moved by Frate, and seconded by Clark, to forward application 5-5658 WinCo Foods #115 to the Arizona Department of Liquor Licenses and Control with a recommendation of approval. The motion carried. Aye votes: Alvarez, Clark, Frate, Knaack, Martinez and Scruggs. Nay vote: Lieberman.

Vice Mayor Frate thanked all the people who came tonight to express their concerns. There must be a lot of people in the area that are ok with it. Each district has about 36,000 residents. He appreciates them coming here. These others who aren't here are your neighbors.

Councilmember Knaack thanked residents for coming and commented that the horse farm has been sold, and many regret it's leaving. The staff, transportation, everyone has worked to build a quality facility that they can be proud of in that neighborhood. On 49th Avenue, there will be an 8' wall to buffer that side. As far as traffic, they are doing the best they can. She feels a WinCo Foods is a good fit for the corner. This is free enterprise, and competition is what it is, so she thanked WinCo Foods for developing in this economic time. She will support the liquor license application.

Councilmember Lieberman spoke. He is not against WinCo Foods building there. He has spent 10 years dealing with this property. He is aware of C-3 zoning and industrial uses. There were industrial buildings on that property for 35 years that have disappeared. He heard that liquor does not make up a large part of the sale. He wishes WinCo Foods the best, but he will vote against the liquor license application. He has a theory, if people were interested in presenting a pro argument, they could show up in support. He has a number of liquor stores and grocery stores in his district. He will back the people who came here to speak about the issue tonight. If other people aren't here, they probably don't care if the license goes in or not. They don't have to drive that far to get liquor now. It isn't going to hurt anyone if there is not a liquor license in that WinCo Foods store.

9. INTERGOVERNMENTAL AGREEMENTS WITH SALT RIVER PROJECT FOR THE DESIGN OF ELECTRICAL FACILITIES FOR STREET LIGHTING

This is a request for City Council to adopt a resolution authorizing the City Manager to enter into three intergovernmental agreements (IGAs) with Salt River Project Agricultural Improvement

and Power District (SRP) for the design of electrical facilities to provide power to three streetlights.

The Streetlight Management Program is responsible for the design, construction, operation, maintenance and repair of the city's roadway lighting system. SRP provides the design of electrical systems that supply power to the streetlight poles within its service area. Currently, three locations in the SRP service area require new power supplies.

- 6632 West Peck Drive (\$1,006.02)
- 4402 West Royal Palm Road (\$1,641.72)
- West side of 51st Avenue, south of Missouri Avenue (\$1,081.02)

These IGAs will allow for the restoration of street lighting at these three locations for the benefit of neighborhood residents and the traveling public.

Funds are available in the FY 2011-12 capital improvement plan. The operating cost associated with these streetlights will be absorbed by the Transportation Services operating budget.

Grants	Capital Expense	One-Time Cost	Budgeted	Unbudgeted	Total
	X		X		\$3,728.76

Account Name, Fund, Account and Line Item Number:

Streetlight Repair, Account No. 1980-68121-550800, \$3,728.76

The recommendation is to waive reading beyond the title and adopt a resolution authorizing the City Manager to enter into three intergovernmental agreements with Salt River Project Agricultural Improvement and Power District for the design of electrical facilities to provide power to three streetlights in an amount not to exceed \$3,728.76.

Resolution No. 4571 New Series was read by number and title only, it being A RESOLUTION OF THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF GLENDALE, MARICOPA COUNTY, ARIZONA, AUTHORIZING AND DIRECTING THE ENTERING INTO OF THREE INTERGOVERNMENTAL AGREEMENTS ENTITLED, "CITY OF GLENDALE DISTRIBUTION DESIGN AND CONSTRUCTION CONTRACT" WITH SALT RIVER PROJECT AGRICULTURAL IMPROVEMENT AND POWER DISTRICT FOR STREET LIGHT INSTALLATION OR RELOCATION AT VARIOUS LOCATIONS WITHIN GLENDALE CITY LIMITS.

Mayor Scruggs stated that she had misread the information in the council packets and no longer needed a presentation on this item.

It was moved by Frate, and seconded by Clark, to waive reading beyond the title and adopt a resolution authorizing the City Manager to enter into three intergovernmental

agreements with Salt River Project Agricultural Improvement and Power District for the design of electrical facilities to provide power to three streetlights in an amount not to exceed \$3,728.76. The motion carried unanimously.

BIDS AND CONTRACTS

10. AWARD OF PROPOSAL 12-21 FOR AN AERIAL TRUCK WITH UTILITY SERVICE BODY

Jamsheed Mehta, AICP, Executive Director, Transportation Services, presented this item.

This is a request for City Council to award RFP 12-21 to Altec Industries, Inc. for the purchase of an aerial truck for the Traffic Signals Division of Transportation Services in an amount not to exceed \$78,131.

Transportation Services contributes to the Vehicle Replacement Fund each year for a variety of vehicles used in its day-to-day operations. The Traffic Signals Division utilizes four aerial trucks on a daily basis to assist in the installation, maintenance and repair of traffic signals throughout the city. The oldest of these trucks, a 1999 Ford F-450, has reached the end of its useful life and was identified for replacement by Traffic Signals and Equipment Management personnel.

In order to replace the truck, a request for proposals (RFP) was issued for a 37-foot, aerial truck with a utility service body. This type of vehicle includes a specially designed, articulated aerial device to allow signal technicians easy access to mast arms and traffic signal components in the field.

Four proposals were received, and an evaluation committee comprised of Equipment Management and Traffic Signals personnel reviewed and scored all offers. Specific evaluation factors considered in the review process included compliance with the specifications, ability to provide parts and service, warranty/ability to honor warranty, delivery schedule and cost. The committee awarded the highest score to the proposal received from Altec Industries, Inc.

A well-maintained traffic signal system efficiently moves traffic throughout the city. The purchase of this truck will ensure that staff has the ability to properly maintain and repair the city's 192 traffic signals with minimal traffic flow interruption.

Transportation Services contributes to the Vehicle Replacement Fund. Funds are available in the FY 2011-12 operating budget of the Field Operations Department.

Grants	Capital Expense	One-Time Cost	Budgeted	Unbudgeted	Total
			X		\$78,131

Account Name, Fund, Account and Line Item Number:

Equipment Replacement, Account No. 1120-13610-551400, \$78,131

The recommendation is to award RFP 12-21 to Altec Industries, Inc. for the purchase of an aerial truck for the Traffic Signals Division of Transportation Services in an amount not to exceed \$78,131.

Vice Mayor Frate asked what will happen with the old truck; will it be traded in or sold? Mr. Mehta advised the truck would be put up for auction. Vice Mayor Frate advised this was not just about the bid price, but to also to deliver the truck on time, provide a warranty and service the truck. Mr. Mehta advised cost is only one of five attributes that were evaluated.

It was moved by Knaack, and seconded by Clark, to award RFP 12-21 to Altec Industries, Inc. for the purchase of an aerial truck for the Traffic Signals Division of Transportation Services in an amount not to exceed \$78,131. The motion carried unanimously.

RESOLUTIONS

11. GRANT AGREEMENTS WITH THE ARIZONA STATE LIBRARY, ARCHIVES AND PUBLIC RECORDS FOR THE ARIZONA JOB ASSISTANCE CENTERS PROJECT

Erik Strunk, Executive Director, Parks, Recreation and Library, presented this item.

This is a request for City Council to adopt a resolution authorizing the submission and acceptance of four grants from the Arizona State Library, Archives and Public Records (ASLAPR) for the acceptance of \$20,666 for the Glendale Public Library to receive new computer equipment to provide expanded job assistance through the Arizona Job Assistance Centers Project.

The Glendale Public Library was recently notified by the ASLAPR of the availability of job assistance grant funds. These grant funds stem from an American Recovery and Reinvestment Act program called the Broadband Technology Opportunities Program Round Two (BTOP II) Grant.

If approved, the Arizona Job Assistance Centers Project will assist Glendale residents seeking employment opportunities via the following components:

- A new Job Help Hub lab that will be located at the Glendale Main Library; and
- Three Virtual Workforce Workstations that will be located at each of the Glendale Public Libraries.

The Job Help Hub lab will be a portable computer lab comprised of 10 student laptops, one instructor laptop, data projector, portable screen, wireless access point, and a printer. The Virtual Workforce stations will consist of a desktop and all-in-one fax, printer and scanner which will be located at each of the libraries. These workstations will be dedicated strictly for job searching, placement assistance, comprehensive skill assessments, development of individual employment plans and one-on-one counseling and career planning via video conferencing through Maricopa County Workforce Connection.

In addition, a part-time qualified instructor will be provided at no charge to assist Glendale job-seekers with resume writing; online job search applications; discovery of employment and economic information on government websites; and finding courses on financial, business planning, and continuing education opportunities.

Citizens will benefit through increased access to job and job-related training, job search and placement assistance, skill assessments, development of employment plans, and career planning. The Job Help Hub and Virtual Workforce Stations have the potential to assist citizens in finding and securing employment.

On February 16, 2012, the BTOP II grant consisting of the Job Help Hub and Virtual Workforce Stations was presented to the Library Advisory Board and the Board indicated its support.

The grant award totals \$20,666 which includes all the equipment and software for the Job Help Hub and the Virtual Workforce Stations. This grant does not require any matching funds.

Grants	Capital Expense	One-Time Cost	Budgeted	Unbudgeted	Total
X					\$20,666

Account Name, Fund, Account and Line Item Number:

A specific project account will be established in Fund 1842, the city's stimulus grant fund, once the grant agreements are formally executed.

The recommendation is to waive reading beyond the title and adopt a resolution authorizing the submission and acceptance of four grants from the Arizona State Library, Archives and Public Records for the Glendale Public Library.

Resolution No. 4572 New Series was read by number and title only, it being A RESOLUTION OF THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF GLENDALE, MARICOPA COUNTY, ARIZONA, AUTHORIZING THE CITY MANAGER TO ENTER INTO AN INTERGOVERNMENTAL AGREEMENT WITH THE ARIZONA STATE LIBRARY, ARCHIVES AND PUBLIC RECORDS FOR THE ARIZONA JOB ASSISTANCE CENTERS PROJECT AT THE GLENDALE PUBLIC LIBRARIES.

Councilmember Alvarez asked if the CAP office kept computers for workforce development and if that was going to be part of this as well. Mr. Strunk said it was not, but that is where they would publicize the availability of the program.

Councilmember Martinez said this was going to be a good program. Mr. Strunk said there will be a part-time instructor putting in 75 hours a month for the next thirteen months. Councilmember Martinez expressed concern that the number of people using the service would overwhelm the part-time instructor. Mr. Strunk advised the intent was to leverage resources available to Glendale and to the public library to bring in services the citizens wouldn't otherwise have. After the thirteen months, there may be additional resources to replace this

program with. It will be publicized as a one year program. Councilmember Martinez asked if citizens can do a lot of this program themselves if the instructor is not there. Mr. Strunk said the virtual workforce station will be open to anyone who wishes to use those services. That will be on a first come, first serve or call ahead. The job hub help labs will require the presence of the instructor to explain how to use the various functions and use the sites. Councilmember Martinez asked if the Department of Economic Security still has employment service offices open with similar programs. He suggested we look into these centers. Mr. Strunk advised the instructor will have knowledge of the services available in the community to provide to citizens.

Vice Mayor Frate indicated this program was not being run by the city but is grant funded. Mr. Strunk advised over 200 libraries in the State of Arizona have received this type of grant from this agency.

It was moved by Martinez, and seconded by Knaack, to pass, adopt and approve Resolution No. 4572 New Series. The motion carried unanimously.

REQUEST FOR FUTURE WORKSHOP AND EXECUTIVE SESSION

It was moved by Frate, and seconded by Knaack, to hold a City Council Workshop at 1:30 p.m. in Room B-3 of the City Council Chambers on Tuesday, May 15, 2012, to be followed by an Executive Session pursuant to A.R.S. 38-431.03. The motion carried unanimously.

CITIZEN COMMENTS

Karen Mahon, a Barrel resident, stated that the city will be paying millions of dollars to the owners if the Coyotes deal goes through for management of Jobing.com arena. She did not want the taxes increased to benefit the Coyotes owner. She also requested that the owners provide an accounting of all monies spent. She said if the cost of management includes booking other events into the arena when it is not being used by Coyotes, then managers need to do a better job of scheduling events. She doesn't feel we are getting our money's worth. She is concerned about the management fees and the cost to Glendale taxpayers. People won't want to spend money in Glendale if the management fees keep driving up costs. She would like the Council to require an accounting from the owners of the Coyotes of how much and where the money is spent.

Larry Grafanakis, a Cactus resident, submitted a speaker's card; however, left before his name was called.

Chuck Jared, a Cactus resident, stated that the City has a chance to make hockey history in Glendale with 8 more games until the cup comes to Glendale. He wants the Coyotes to beat LA.

Ken Jones, an Ocotillo resident, commented on the front page of The Glendale Star and a picture of several Councilmembers. He talked about the cost of an average season hockey ticket and mentioned that Councilmembers had access to free suite tickets. He discussed the costs that the Coyotes wanted from Glendale taxpayers. He said if the deal goes through, he did not feel that it would survive a scrutiny by the Goldwater Institute. He said \$280 million dollars is too much to be giving away to a highway robber.

Bonnie Steiger, a Saguaro resident, stated that the City should be proud of the Coyotes and commented about the need for entertainment in the City, adding that the Coyotes will provide it.

Brooke Kowacz, a Barrel resident, said she founded a blog called Zonie nation and started a petition to help keep the Coyotes in Glendale. They have collected 384 signatures from Glendale residents but have a total of 800 signatures so far. She printed and brought them to the meeting. Businesses would like the Coyotes to stay. It would be good to have a Stanley Cup winning team to be in the arena. She concluded her statements with a plea to keep the Coyotes in Glendale.

Andrew Marwick, a Phoenix resident, commented on the agreement regarding the Coyotes. He thinks Glendale should carefully consider the costs and benefits of any agreement and doesn't want to see the City jump too quickly into an agreement. The taxpayers of Glendale will have the burden of the costs. He thinks maybe this issue should be taken to a referendum of the voters as this will have a major impact on the residents. He talked about the children's play area at Arrowhead Mall and the possibility of a niche that needed to be filled by the Glendale Parks & Recreation.

Darcy Marwick, a Phoenix resident, commented on a recent trip to Cerretta's Candy Company. She noted small businesses like Cerretta's can't be expected to pay for a multi-billion dollar enterprise that pays performers over a million dollars on average. She stated that everyone should be proud of the Coyotes, but not the NHL, adding that the NHL is taking from the City of Glendale. The issue needs to be put on a referendum because there aren't enough hockey fans in the City of Glendale.

Jon Pickett, a Yucca resident, commented that he is a sports fan. He stated that a lot of money had been spent on the arena for sports and entertainment and it would be a shame to lose it.

Jeannine Doyle, a Barrel resident, stated that she owns her home and pays taxes in Glendale. She became a season ticketholder when Glendale backed building the arena. She and her family support the arena by going to the games and spending money in the entertainment district. She continued that keeping the Coyotes is a better alternative than any other plan submitted to date.

Arthur L. Thruston, a Cactus resident, stated he has lived in Glendale for 28 years, paying taxes. He commented that when the team first came to the city he was a season ticketholder; however things change. He stated that the City is in desperate trouble; being \$31 million down... He does not believe the Coyotes have found a legitimate owner. He talked about Mr. Jamison and his record with the hockey teams. He stated his belief that 66% of the City of Glendale by poll wants the arena to go. He doesn't want the arena to go, however, the City needs to let Mr. Jamison go and find a legitimate buyer.

Bryan Willingham, a Cholla resident, stated he and his family are long term residents in the City. He is excited about the Coyotes being in Glendale and the support they have received from Glendale. He knows what it is like to have a liability and the investment always seems to pay off if you hold on to it long enough. The City needs to get creative in solving the problem. He thinks Westgate, the Coyotes, the Super Bowl, and the Cardinals being in Glendale is good for commerce and the City gets national exposure from these events. This is a benefit for the small

businesses in Glendale. He believes this will eventually work out and wants the Council to continue with this investment. As a taxpayer, he also supports the 7/10 tax. Every city has taken measures to get through this time, but it is necessary to provide for core services. He commented that he doesn't want to see cuts to core services.

Ben Shroyer, a Barrel resident, has been a Glendale resident all of his life, except for a short time living in El Mirage. He met with Councilmember Knaack at her open house to discuss issues with her. He talked about his water bill being a bit higher living in Glendale, but he has a larger house and a pool so uses more water now. He moved back to Glendale to support the Coyotes. Mr. Jamison has proven hockey can work in a non-traditional market.

Monique Reaux, a Phoenix resident, commented that just because people don't show up to the meetings, doesn't mean they don't care about the issues in Glendale. She spoke about Ms. Brook being very young and doing her part by getting people to sign the petition. She said every time the Coyotes go to the playoffs, it is money for the City. She hopes the City is taking their share. She asked the Council to make a deal that is fair and good for the City and the Coyotes so the City will thrive.

COUNCIL COMMENTS AND SUGGESTIONS

Councilmember Clark commented on the speaker who mentioned the perk of \$20,000 a year when anyone on Council attends hockey games and uses the city's suite. She said last year she attended two hockey games and was invited by the Marketing Director and Economic Development Department. These invitations were to meet prospective entrepreneurs who were thinking of settling in Glendale. It was a working event. Councilmembers were fortunate to attend two Blackhawk games and two Predators games. She is planning on seeing two LA Kings games and two more games after that. She is glad for the extra revenue that comes to the City of Glendale when the fans come to the hockey games. Councilmember Clark commented on the topic of property taxes and that several of the speakers did not want higher taxes to pay for the team. She continued that she would address this more fully in the future but that people's taxes and property taxes were not being raised to pay for the team. On May 16, 2012, she will have her next district meeting at Coyote Ridge Elementary School at 6:30 p.m.

Councilmember Lieberman said he did not agree with Councilmember Clark. He commented the city was getting \$17 million in the budget for the Coyotes next year and \$92 million in the next five years, combined. He said he didn't care what anybody says some of that has to come from the increases in both sales tax and property tax. He didn't know where else the City would get it from, nobody is going to fund us as a gift \$92 million in five years.

Vice Mayor Frate commented that on April 25th, the Traffic Department activated a new traffic signal at 83 Avenue, just south of Union Hills, by the Wal-Mart. The Traffic Department did an exceptional job in installing that signal and was two months ahead of schedule. On April 28th, the City has a ribbon cutting at the Glendale Tree Trail on the west side of the Main Library on Brown. Over 100 people attended classes to learn about what trees to plant and how to take care of them. This was provided through a grant through the Bureau of Reclamation. He also represented the City of Glendale at the rededication at the Luke Air Force Base Gymnasium in

memory of Lt. Col. Frank Bryant of the 56th Fighter Wing. He attended a memorial for Col. Bryant last year. Col. Bryant was killed in Afghanistan last year and was an advisor working with the Afghan Air Force. He thanked the Glendale Civic Pride Ambassadors for collecting and donating money for a plaque that is on the gymnasium honoring Col. Bryant. Vice Mayor Frate also thanked the Boy Scout troop that attended the meeting. He also thanked the Coyotes fans that attended the meeting. He appreciates the support. He mentioned the speakers who were from Phoenix and stated their time might be better spent tackling issues in Phoenix. He asked that we watch children around water, as there was a near drowning in Gilbert last week.

Councilmember Martinez wanted to thank everyone that came out to the meeting. He stated we needed to keep the team here. He stated the Council will do their very best during the negotiation of the Coyotes lease to make sure the City will get a good deal. Sometimes we have to bear a little pain in the short term for long term gain, and this is the case with the Coyotes. The \$20 million is a placeholder for the lease agreement; this has been lowered to \$17 million.

Councilmember Knaack thanked everyone for coming out. The Coyotes game was unbelievable. She thanked Ben and Karen for their comments. She thanked Jeannine and the Barrel people for coming to the meeting. She expressed her support for the comments made by Councilmember Martinez.

Mayor Scruggs express her thanks to everyone for attending the meeting being very articulate, courteous and she really enjoyed having them here. She stated that she was not going to be anyone's favorite person, get ready to put your thumbs down. As much as she has been associated with the whole business of building Westgate and all of that out there, she believes that the City can, and must, fill that arena with other types of activities that do not require paying investors so they have a return on their money. So, at this point, unless she hears something very, very different, unfortunately, she won't be joining everyone in the howl. I know, get them ready, thumbs down. Mayor Scruggs commented that she was meeting with Mr. Cruz today. He would like to be Mayor, and would like to be sitting up here in about seven months or whatever it is, and be the Mayor of the city. She said when she took the oath of office; at no point did she say her responsibility was to insure that businesses and investors make a profit on their money. Her responsibility is to make sure the citizens have the best services and the best place to live, and you can't have both. You just can't have both, and that tax increase may help one business, the Phoenix Coyotes, it is just going to devastate, just devastate many other businesses in this city and that is just not right. Now, maybe, we will see something different. All this talk, the \$25 million, the drop to \$20, the drop to \$17, she has never seen anything in writing. She stated that maybe some of her colleagues have, but she has not. She has never seen anything in writing. There is no deal in writing. She does not understand passing a budget that puts money in for something that you have never even seen as a real deal. So, the Council will see what comes along. Maybe it will be something different and maybe it will be something that she can support, but at this point, she knows you have read in the newspaper and you probably wonder why she is not. Now, she's going to talk to Monique Reaux. Mayor Scruggs commented that Ms. Reaux is really a very impressive lady and she's read some of what Ms. Reaux has written. Mayor Scruggs continued that Ms. Reaux is articulate, thoughtful and sincere, and wants what is right. Mayor Scruggs commented that she would like Ms. Reaux to contact the Mayor's office and give her email address to them, so that the Mayor could email the agreement that the City

has with the NHL. What she would like Ms. Reaux to do is read it so she would not get confused by some of these statements that if the City makes a lot of money in the playoffs, they won't have to pay the NHL \$25 million. Twenty five million is the ceiling, and fit in there are the losses at the arena and the losses of the team. Mayor Scruggs continued that you have read the team loses \$37, \$47 million a year, whatever. The City can get more revenue in, that \$25 million is not going away, so if you would like to read it for yourself, because she knows Ms. Reaux works really hard at this, and asked that Ms. Reaux contact the office and Mayor Scruggs will email it to her. . Whoever else wants to read that, the Mayor's office will email it to you so you know exactly what is going on. Mayor Scruggs expressed her respect for the Coyotes fans and her love of the Coyotes. She continued that it is breaking her heart what is going on right now. She hopes that they win and commented that Tippet has to be one of the best coaches in the world and Mike Smith is part machine. She doesn't believe that he is totally human at all. She continued that she had met Shane Doan and he is just a true, sincere, great guy. She is very, very proud of them. Mayor Scruggs stated that her position, quite honestly, and she has to keep the Mayor hat on, is to keep this city in good condition and leaving us with \$4 million in our bank account for a city this size, just won't work. At the same time, the car dealers, they are going nuts about a potential increase in sales tax. There is no way in the world you can have Peoria, some people live less than a mile from Peoria, with their 1.8% sales tax and Glendale is going to charge 2.9%. You go the other way to Phoenix for 2.0%. How can Glendale do that to the businesses? How can Glendale hurt them that way? Mayor Scruggs continued that these are very difficult, complex issues and they are kind of clouded right now by the total, wonderful euphoria of the Coyotes winning, but it is so much more than that. Mayor Scruggs thanked everyone for their respect and she hopes a conclusion can be reached that the City is happy with.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 9:41 p.m.

Pamela Hanna
Pamela Hanna - City Clerk